

**MINUTES
ORO VALLEY TOWN COUNCIL
REGULAR SESSION
APRIL 2, 2025
ORO VALLEY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
11000 N. LA CAÑADA DRIVE**

REGULAR SESSION AT OR AFTER 5:00 PM

CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Winfield called the meeting to order at 5:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: Joseph C. Winfield, Mayor
Melanie Barrett, Vice-Mayor
Harry Greene, Councilmember
Joyce Jones-Ivey, Councilmember
Mary Murphy, Councilmember
Josh Nicolson, Councilmember
Elizabeth Robb, Councilmember

EXECUTIVE SESSION

1. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A)(3) and (A)(4) to obtain legal advice regarding the Oro Valley Church of the Nazarene (OVCN) application for additional height regarding the applicant's appeal of the Planning & Zoning Commission's denial of the OVCN height request on January 14, 2025
2. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A)(3) and (A)(4) to discuss or consult with the attorneys for the public body regarding pending litigation on the Clifton matter in order to consider its position and instruct its attorneys

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Harry Greene to go into Executive Session at 5:03 p.m., 1. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A)(3) and (A)(4) to obtain legal advice regarding the Oro Valley Church of the Nazarene (OVCN) application for additional height regarding the applicant's appeal of the Planning & Zoning Commission's denial of the OVCN height request on January 14, 2025, and 2. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03 (A)(3) and (A)(4) to discuss or consult with the attorneys for the public body regarding pending litigation on the Clifton matter in order to consider its position and instruct its attorneys

Vote: 7 - 0 Carried

Mayor Winfield announced that the following staff would be joining Council in the first Executive Session: Town Manager Jeff Wilkins, Deputy Town Manager Chris Cornelison, Town Attorney Nathan Rothschild, Planning Manager Bayer Vella, and Town Clerk Mike Standish.

Mayor Winfield announced that the following staff would be joining Council in the second Executive Session: Town Manager Jeff Wilkins, Deputy Town Manager Chris Cornelison, Town Attorney Nathan Rothschild, Attorney from the Municipal Risk Pool, and Town Clerk Mike Standish.

RESUME REGULAR SESSION AT OR AFTER 6:00 PM

CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Winfield resumed the Regular Session at 6:13 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: Joseph C. Winfield, Mayor
Melanie Barrett, Vice-Mayor
Harry Greene, Councilmember
Joyce Jones-Ivey, Councilmember
Mary Murphy, Councilmember
Josh Nicolson, Councilmember
Elizabeth Robb, Councilmember

1. APPROVAL OF ANY DIRECTION TO THE TOWN ATTORNEY AND/OR NECESSARY STAFF AS DISCUSSED IN EXECUTIVE SESSION REGARDING ACTIONS TO TAKE IN THE CLIFTON LITIGATION MATTER

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Vice-Mayor Melanie Barrett to give authority to file a notice of appeal and proceed as directed to take all necessary action related to pursuing an appeal, in relation to the Pima County Superior Court cause of action C20215129.

Vote: 6 - 0 Carried

Other: Councilmember Mary Murphy (ABSTAINING)

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Winfield led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

UPCOMING MEETING ANNOUNCEMENTS

Town Clerk Mike Standish announced the upcoming Town meetings.

MAYOR AND COUNCIL REPORTS ON CURRENT EVENTS

Councilmember Greene reported that he had attended a Crystal Apple event to honor outstanding teachers that were nominated by their students.

Councilmember Jones-Ivey encouraged citizens to volunteer and participate in Amphi School Districts Project Graduation's upcoming events and fundraisers.

TOWN MANAGER'S REPORT ON CURRENT EVENTS

Town Manager Jeff Wilkins reported the following

- Free Shred event, April 5, 2025
- Information on the Project Echelon Cycling event
- Update on the Celebrate Oro Valley event
- Upcoming Oro Valley events

ORDER OF BUSINESS

Mayor Winfield reviewed the order of business and stated the order would stand as posted.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

There were no informational items.

CALL TO AUDIENCE

PRESENTATIONS

1. Proclamation - Week of the Young Child

Mayor Winfield proclaimed the week of April 5 through April 11, 2025, as the Week of the Young Child in Oro Valley.

Pima North Regional Director for First Things First Amy Morales Baum and Executive Director of the Southern Arizona Association of Young Children Ashley Barbara accepted the proclamation.

2. Presentation and update from Children's Museum Executive Director Hilary Van Alsborg

Executive Director for the Children's Museum Oro Valley Ms. Van Alsborg provided a presentation and update regarding the Children's Museum.

3. *Proclamation - Education and Sharing Day

Mayor Winfield proclaimed April 9, 2025, as Education and Sharing Day in Oro Valley.

Rabbi Zimmerman accepted the proclamation.

CONSENT AGENDA

- A. Minutes - March 19, 2025
- B. Request for approval of a two year extension of the Foothills Business Park Final Plat amendment located near the northeast corner of Oracle Road and Hanley Boulevard

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Harry Greene to approve Consent agenda items (A) and (B).

Vote: 7 - 0 Carried

REGULAR AGENDA

- 2. TWO ITEMS REGARDING THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION'S DENIAL OF AN APPLICANT'S REQUEST FOR INCREASED BUILDING HEIGHT ALLOWANCES WITHIN PRIVATE SCHOOL ZONING FOR A PROPOSED NEW ORO VALLEY CHURCH OF THE NAZARENE SANCTUARY AND MULTIPURPOSE BUILDING SITUATED NORTHEAST OF THE CALLE CONCORDIA AND CALLE BUENA VISTA INTERSECTION

ITEM A: APPLICANT'S REQUEST TO CONTINUE PUBLIC HEARING REGARDING AN APPEAL OF THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION'S DENIAL FOR A PERIOD OF EIGHT MONTHS

ITEM B: PUBLIC HEARING: DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING AN APPEAL OF THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION DENIAL OF THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST FOR INCREASED BUILDING HEIGHT ALLOWANCES WITHIN PRIVATE SCHOOL ZONING FOR A PROPOSED NEW ORO VALLEY CHURCH OF THE NAZARENE SANCTUARY AND MULTIPURPOSE BUILDING SITUATED NORTHEAST OF THE CALLE CONCORDIA AND CALLE BUENA VISTA INTERSECTION

Mayor Winfield provided a brief overview of the expectations for items 2A and 2B.

Planning Manager Bayer Vella presented item 2A and included the following:

- Item A, Continuance
- Zoning: Private School (PS) Zoning & Building Height Process
- Revised Process Requested by Applicant

Mr. Gillespie, with Rose Law Group PC, and representing the applicant, continued the presentation and included the following:

- Why is the requested 8-month continuance best for everyone?
- Primary concerns expressed by neighbors
- Development Plan Application Submittal Requirements
- The Church can Develop "By Right" by adhering to the following base development standards
- Why is the requested 8-month continuance best?
- Massive Community Support for this request

The following individuals spoke in support of item 2A

Logan Colby
Lawrence Knight
Oro Valley resident Tony Cox
Oro Valley resident Kim Chatterton
Oro Valley resident Robert Sabo
Oro Valley resident Sally Gray
Oro Valley resident Ray Laker
Oro Valley resident Patricia Howie
Oro Valley resident Lisa Stuessel
Oro Valley resident Philip Vandivort
Oro Valley resident Julian Benitez
Oro Valley resident Carolyn Jaedecke
Oro Valley resident William Slanaker
Bern Jones
Oro Valley resident Terry Reagan
Dean Hood
Oro Valley resident Lynn Huggins
Jamie Martinez
Oro Valley resident Mary Peterson
Oro Valley resident Steve Solomon
Monica Duran
Oro Valley resident Liz Loftis
Oro Valley resident Rain Pinneo
Oro Valley resident Judith Gilpin - Gregor
Oro Valley resident Shawn Hellebayck
Oro Valley resident Jim Ingram
Oro Valley resident Kirsten Puddicombe

The following individuals spoke in opposition to item 2A.

Oro Valley resident Anthony Ferrara
Oro Valley resident Tricia Tozier
Oro Valley resident Tim Tarris
Oro Valley resident Devin Smith

Discussion ensued amongst the Council, staff, and Mr. Gillespie regarding item 2A.

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Harry Greene to continue the building height exception appeal public hearing, as requested by the applicant, to the December 3rd, 2025 Town Council Regular Session.

Discussion continued amongst Council, staff, Mr. Gillespie, and Mr. Craig Coulter, Lead Pastor of the Oro Valley Church of the Nazarene, regarding item #2A.

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Harry Greene to continue the building height exception appeal public hearing, as requested by the applicant, to the December 3rd, 2025 Town Council Regular Session.

Vote: 3 - 4 Failed

OPPOSED: Vice-Mayor Melanie Barrett
Councilmember Joyce Jones-Ivey
Councilmember Josh Nicolson
Councilmember Elizabeth Robb

Mayor Winfield recessed the meeting at 8:43 p.m.

Mayor Winfield reconvened the meeting at 9:00 p.m.

Oro Valley Planning Manager Bayer Vella presented item 2B and included the following:

- Item B, Appeal Public Hearing
- Applicant's Proposal
- Zoning: Building Heights & Process
- "The Issue of Height" - Decision Factors
- Sanctuary "Auditorium style seating" - Height, Size, and Seating Capacity
- Seating Capacity & Mass tied to Offsite Impacts (Traffic, Parking, View, etc.)
- Neighbor Comments
- Summary

Mr. Gillespie with Rose Law Group PC, and representing the applicant, continued the presentation and included designs, images and information regarding the proposed request.

Mayor Winfield opened the public hearing.

The following individuals spoke in support of item 2B.

Clint Haas
Oro Valley resident Patricia Howie
Ray Hahn
Oro Valley resident Philip Vandivort
Olivia Hahn
Oro Valley resident William Slanaker
Oro Valley resident David Carrol
Oro Valley resident Charlie Bowles
Monica Duran

The following individuals spoke in opposition of item 2B.

Oro Valley resident Anthony Ferrara
Oro Valley resident Tricia Tozier
Oro Valley resident Tim Tarris

Mayor Winfield closed the public hearing.

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Harry Greene to overrule the Planning and Zoning Commission's denial of the building height increase requests and conditionally grant a building height increase of 36 feet.

Discussion ensued amongst Council, staff and Mr. Gillespie regarding item #2B.

Mayor Winfield requested to amend the main motion, to overrule the Planning and Zoning Commission's denial of the building height increase request and conditionally grant a building height increase of 36 feet maximum, including conditions one, two and four. Seconded by Councilmember Greene.

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Harry Greene **FINAL MOTION AS AMENDED:** to overrule the Planning and Zoning Commission's denial of the building height increase request and conditionally grant a building height increase of 36 feet maximum, including conditions one, two and four.

ATTACHMENT 1
Conditions of Approval

1. Landscape buffer on the north of the new development area shall be a minimum of 30 feet wide and shall contain a continuous vegetative screen consisting of two-rows of either existing vegetation and/or new 36 inch box trees, as well as minimum 10-gallon shrubs and cacti, and a continuous 8 foot screen wall. Locations of these elements shall be subject to Planning and Zoning Administrator approval.

2. Landscape buffer on the west of the new development area shall be a minimum of 30 feet wide and shall contain a continuous vegetative screen consisting of two-rows of either existing vegetation and/or new 36 inch box trees, as well as minimum 10-gallon shrubs and cacti, and a continuous 6 foot screen wall. Locations of these elements shall be subject to Planning and Zoning Administrator approval.

~~3. The building roof and screening parapet heights shall be restricted to the use of each space as demonstrated in Exhibit 1.~~

4. The new Sanctuary building shall be positioned between the existing sanctuary to the west, and CDO High School to the east as indicated in the attached Conceptual Master Plan, Exhibit 2, such that the view impacts from the west looking toward the mountains are minimally impacted.

Discussion continued amongst Council, staff, Mr. Gillespie, and Mr. Craig Coulter, Lead Pastor of the Oro Valley Church of the Nazarene, regarding item #2B.

Motion by Vice-Mayor Melanie Barrett, **seconded by** Councilmember Joyce Jones-Ivey to amend the motion and substitute 29 feet for 36 feet.

Discussion continued amongst Council, staff, Mr. Gillespie and Mr. Craig Coulter, Lead Pastor of the Oro Valley Church of the Nazarene, regarding item #2B.

Vice Mayor Barrett requested to recess the meeting.

Mayor Winfield recessed the meeting at 10:04 p.m.

Mayor Winfield reconvened the meeting at 10:09 p.m.

Discussion continued amongst Council, staff, Mr. Gillespie, and Mr. Coulter regarding item #2B.

Vice Mayor Barrett requested to withdraw her motion to amend the main motion, seconded by Councilmember Jones-Ivey.

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Harry Greene **FINAL MOTION AS AMENDED:** to overrule the Planning and Zoning Commission's denial of the building height increase request and conditionally grant a building height increase of 36 feet maximum, including conditions one, two and four.

ATTACHMENT 1
Conditions of Approval

1. Landscape buffer on the north of the new development area shall be a minimum of 30 feet wide and shall contain a continuous vegetative screen consisting of two-rows of either existing vegetation and/or

new 36 inch box trees, as well as minimum 10-gallon shrubs and cacti, and a continuous 8 foot screen wall. Locations of these elements shall be subject to Planning and Zoning Administrator approval.

2. Landscape buffer on the west of the new development area shall be a minimum of 30 feet wide and shall contain a continuous vegetative screen consisting of two-rows of either existing vegetation and/or new 36 inch box trees, as well as minimum 10-gallon shrubs and cacti, and a continuous 6 foot screen wall. Locations of these elements shall be subject to Planning and Zoning Administrator approval.

~~3. The building roof and screening parapet heights shall be restricted to the use of each space as demonstrated in Exhibit 1.~~

4. The new Sanctuary building shall be positioned between the existing sanctuary to the west, and CDO High School to the east as indicated in the attached Conceptual Master Plan, Exhibit 2, such that the view impacts from the west looking toward the mountains are minimally impacted.

Discussion continued amongst Council, staff, and Mr. Gillespie regarding item #2B.

Vote: 7 - 0 Carried

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

There were no future agenda items requested.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

3. Pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A)(5) regarding discussions with designated representatives of the public body to consider its position and instructions regarding negotiations with employee organizations regarding salaries or compensation

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Mary Murphy to go into Executive Session at 10:13 p.m. pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03 (A)(5) regarding discussions with designated representatives of the public body to consider its position and instructions regarding negotiations with employee organizations regarding salaries or compensation

Vote: 7 - 0 Carried

Mayor Winfield stated that the following staff members would join Council in Executive Session: Town Manager Jeff Wilkins, Town Attorney Nathan Rothschild, Human Resource Director Andy Votava, Chief of Police Kara Riley, and Town Clerk Mike Standish.

RESUME REGULAR SESSION

Mayor Winfield resumed the Regular Session at 11:50 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER

REGULAR AGENDA

3. APPROVAL OF ANY DIRECTION TO THE TOWN MANAGER AND/OR NECESSARY STAFF AS DISCUSSED IN EXECUTIVE SESSION PERTAINING TO NEGOTIATIONS WITH EMPLOYEE ORGANIZATIONS REGARDING SALARIES OR COMPENSATION

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Josh Nicolson to proceed as directed.

Vote: 7 - 0 Carried

ADJOURNMENT

Motion by Mayor Joseph C. Winfield, **seconded by** Councilmember Harry Greene to adjourn the meeting at 11:51 p.m.

Vote: 7 - 0 Carried

Michelle Stine, MMC, CPM
Deputy Town Clerk

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the minutes of the regular session of the Town of Oro Valley, Arizona held on the 2nd day of April 2025. I further certify that the meeting was called and held and that a quorum was present.

Mike Standish, CMC
Town Clerk